

Part A

Sherri Ann Charleston's dissertation contains a lot of other scholars' language verbatim without quotation marks. Parts of Charleston's dissertation were published previously, word for word, by her advisor, Rebecca Scott, and others. Charleston will lift whole sentences and paragraphs from other scholars' work without quotation marks, then add a correct reference somewhere in the footnote ending the long paragraph. I include relevant footnotes in full below to clarify. I highlight in red correct as well as incorrect but relevant parenthetical references. Where there is no red highlighting it is because I can find no relevant citation at all. Including a reference in the footnotes does not allow the author to omit quotation marks.

Sherri Ann Charleston, *The Fruits of Citizenship: African Americans, Military Service, and the Cause of Cuba Libre, 1868-1920*. Dissertation, University of Michigan (History), 2009

A1

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 269-70

Anthony Leopold Gusman, a white attorney in New Orleans, had taken on the case of an African American man named Samuel Wright who had been sentenced to death for assault with intent to commit rape. Gusman decided to challenge Wright's indictment by denying the legitimacy of the still unratified Louisiana Constitution of 1898; thus, challenging the legitimacy of the Jefferson Parish grand jury that had issued the indictment, arguing that the convening of a twelve member jury violated the prior Louisiana Constitution of 1879 which called for a sixteen-member grand jury. The Circuit Court Judge, however, was not convinced and ruled against Gusman, clearing the way for Sam Wright to be executed.*75

On February 19, Gusman initiated an appeal to the U.S. Supreme Court and the Afro-American Council joined the fight, hopeful that the legality of the Louisiana Constitution would be tested in the Supreme Court.

*75 Scott, *Degrees*, 190. See Emmett J. Scott to Booker T. Washington, in Louis R. Harlan, et. al., eds. *The Booker T. Washington Papers*, vol. 4 (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1975), 65-7.

Rebecca J. Scott, *Degrees of Freedom: Louisiana and Cuba after Slavery* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2005), 190

A. L. Gusman, a white attorney in New Orleans, had taken on the case of a man named Samuel Wright who had been sentenced to death for assault with intent to commit rape. Gusman decided to challenge Wright's indictment by denying the legitimacy of the unratified Louisiana Constitution of 1898, and thus of the Jefferson Parish grand jury that had issued the indictment, because the convening of a twelve-member grand jury violated the prior Louisiana Constitution

of 1879, which called for a sixteen-member grand jury. ... Accepting the sheriff's plea, and apparently characterizing portions of Gusman's argument as a "political question" over which Congress alone had jurisdiction, the Circuit Court ruled in favor of Marrero on February 3, 1900, clearing the way for Wright to be executed.

On February 19, 1900, Gusman initiated an appeal to the U.S. Supreme Court, and Sheriff Marrero consigned Wright to the state penitentiary to be put to hard labor.

A2

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 111-12

Over the years, heirs of grantees and other owners came to own *pesos de posesión*, fractional portions of the undivided and unsurveyed *haciendas comuneras*.^{*78}

In the 1860's and 1870's, during and after the Ten Years' War, some former slaves had already begun to take possession of small tracts on the edges of plantations and in nearby mountains.^{*79} The Spanish Civil Code introduced in 1889 and applied to Cuba in 1890 held that rights of *dominio* (dominion) could be extinguished over time through *prescripción* (prescription), at which point a squatter who could prove lengthy possession would acquire a recognizable claim. ...^{*80}

^{*78} Scott and Zeuske, "Property in Writing": 686; Corbitt, "Mercedes and Realengos": 277; Hoernel, "Sugar and Social Change": 222-5.

^{*79} Scott and Zeuske, "Property in Writing": 682.

^{*80} Scott and Zeuske, "Property in Writing": 676-7, 680.

Rebecca J. Scott and Michael Zeuske. "Property in Writing, Property on the Ground: Pigs, Horses, Land, and Citizenship in the Aftermath of Slavery, Cuba, 1880-1909," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Oct., 2002, Vol. 44, No. 4, 685-86

Over the years the heirs of the grantees and other owners came to hold *pesos de posesion* (fractional portions) of the undivided and unsurveyed rural properties, known as *haciendas comuneras*. In many instances titles had become vague, and in notarial records land was at times simply "said to be owned" by so-and-so. It is not difficult to see how it might be possible to settle on such land without any individual owner recognizing the intrusion.

Scott and Zeuske 2002, 677

The Spanish Civil Code, introduced in 1889 and applied to Cuba in 1890, did hold that rights of *dominio* could be extinguished over time through *prescripción* (prescription), at which point a squatter who could prove lengthy possession would acquire a recognized claim.

A3

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 84-85

The uncertainty was largely a result of disparate opinions among the insurrectionists; a shared opposition to Spanish colonialism by no means meant a uniform consensus on the aims of the revolt. Some favored annexation to the United States and others sought full independence. Many were hostile to the institution of slavery, but wished to avoid alienating potential supporters among slaveholders, also hoping to maintain continued agricultural production throughout the war. At the same time, the insurrectionists sought to take a stand on slavery that would promote the revolt and increase its popular and international appeal. They were increasingly aware of the need for North American support, which, following the ratification of the Thirteenth Amendment and the election of Ulysses S. Grant to the American presidency, seemed to be contingent on an abolitionist stance. In April of 1869, representatives from rebel groups within Oriente, Camagüey, Las Villas, and Occidente joined at the Assembly of Guáimaro and wrote a constitution that declared “all inhabitants of the Republic entirely free.”*7

*7 [Scott, *Slave Emancipation*, 47](#). On the 1869 constitution in exile communities within the United States see Poyo, *With All, and for the Good of All*, 29-30.

Scott, R. J. (2000). *Slave Emancipation in Cuba: The Transition to Free Labor, 1860-1899*. United States: University of Pittsburgh Press, 45, 47

Shared opposition to Spanish colonialism, however, by no means meant unanimity on the aims of the revolt. Some of the insurrectionists favored annexation to the United States, others sought full independence. Many were hostile to the institution of slavery, in part because of their resentment of large-scale western slaveholding planters, in part because aid in the maintenance of slavery was a component of Spain's hold over the island. The leaders of the insurgency, however, initially drew back from full abolition. They wished to avoid alienating potential supporters among slaveholders and to obtain revenues and goods for the war effort from continued agricultural production. At the same time, they sought to take a stand on slavery that would promote the insurrection and increase its popular and international appeal. The rebels thus took partial steps toward formal abolition, while attempting to avoid disruption of the social relations of slavery.

...

Insurgent leaders were becoming increasingly aware of the need for North American support, which, following the ratification of the Thirteenth Amendment and the election of Ulysses S. Grant to the presidency, seemed to be contingent upon an abolitionist stance. When the different rebel groups joined at the Assembly of Guiciamaro in April 1869, they drew up a declaration proclaiming that "all inhabitants of the Republic are entirely free."

A4

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 92-93

Meanwhile, in Cuba, multiple events demonstrated what the Spanish surrender at Santiago would mean for Cuban Independence.*22 It did not bode well for the Cubans' future when the United States assumed control of key cities and towns within the province and prohibited the soldiers from entering the eastern Capital. Moreover, all residents of Santiago passed directly under the authority and protection of the United States; incumbent civil officials and local constabulary authorities were to be ratified in their positions. To have been prohibited from entering the city for the ceremonies following the final surrender of Santiago, and then to be denied a part in the municipal administration, both offended the insurgents' pride and negated the very purpose of Cuban arms. That same day, García forwarded to Máximo Gómez an official protest of American actions and warned the insurgent forces against relinquishing any authority to the army of intervention. As the General explained, he was no longer disposed towards cooperating with the plans of the American army.*23

*22 For contemporary accounts of the war around Santiago see Frederick W. Ramsden, "Diary of the British Consul at Santiago During Hostilities," *McClure's Magazine* XI, no. 6 (Oct. 1898):580-91; Ramsden, "Diary of the British Consul at Santiago During Hostilities," *McClure's Magazine* XII, no. 1 (Nov. 1898):62-70.

*23 García quoted in Pérez, *Cuba between Empires*, 208-10. On his entrance into the city see Bacardí, *Crónicas de Santiago*, 165-66.

Pérez 1983, 208-9

By the proposed terms of the surrender, the United States would assume control of key cities and towns in Oriente province. Incumbent civil officials and local constabulary authorities were to be ratified in their positions. All residents of the province passed directly under the authority and protection of the United States.⁷³ On July 17, a joint Spanish and American commission completed the terms of capitulation.

...

To have been excluded from the negotiations and denied the opportunity to participate in the ceremonies attending the formal surrender of Santiago injured already bruised Cuban sensibilities. To have been prohibited from entering the eastern capital, however, a city of powerful emotional significance for the oriental insurgent command, and denied a part in municipal administration in favor of incumbent Spanish office-holders, negated the very purpose of Cuban arms. That Santiago was now considered by the Americans as "part of the Union" was the final outrage to the eastern insurgent command. "I will never accept," General García vowed angrily, "that our country be considered as conquered territory."

...

Later that day, García forwarded to Máximo Gómez an official protest of American actions accompanied with his resignation. American actions in Santiago, García wrote bitterly; made continued cooperation with the United States impossible. "I am no longer disposed to continue obeying the orders and cooperating with the plans of the American Army"

A5

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 30-31

On April 11, President McKinley sent a message to Congress recommending a "neutral intervention" in Cuba to pacify the island and protect American interests. While making it known that he would veto any legislation providing for the recognition of Cuban Independence, the President left unanswered the question of how the United States planned to govern the island after intervening. The open-ended prospects regarding Cuban annexation prompted a response from the fledgling but important beet sugar industry. Precipitated by the decline of Cuban sugar imports since the restart of the war in 1895, beet sugar had only recently begun to flourish in the United States. However, such a young industry would not survive the onslaught of cheap cane sugar following a possible Cuban annexation.*20

*20 Foner, *The Spanish-Cuban-American War*, 1:261-280.

Pérez 1983, 184, 186, 187

The American purpose in Cuba, McKinley concluded, consisted of a "forcible intervention as a neutral to stop the war." Having submitted his message, the president let it be known that he would veto any congressional resolution providing for the recognition of Cuban independence.

...

At stake too, was the fate of the fledgling but important domestic beet sugar industry. The Cuban insurrection in 1895 and the subsequent sharp decline of Cuban sugar imports had given the beet sugar industry in the United States a powerful boost.

...

Beet sugar had become a flourishing enterprise in the United States, an industry that would not survive the onslaught of cheap cane sugar following the annexation of Cuba.

A6

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 8

As men traveled to the muster stations in large numbers, they resolved the dispute, accepting enlistment without a guarantee of access to commissioned ranks. Many did so, at least in part, because military service was closely associated with masculinity. Some argued, that if black men served in Cuba they might succeed in asserting their manhood and therefore their suitability for full citizenship. These notions of citizenship, to the extent that they were predicated on military service, were highly gendered and tied to conventional constructions of full citizenship as an exclusively male domain.

Mitchell, M. (2005). Righteous Propagation: African Americans and the Politics of Racial Destiny After Reconstruction. University of North Carolina Press, 55

Whereas some African Americans were staunch anti-imperialists who believed any form of imperialism had dire consequences for people of color, many others welcomed U.S. wars for empire. They did so, in part, because imperialism involved attributes closely associated with masculinity: if black men bravely served in American war efforts, for example, they might succeed in refuting long-standing charges that manliness was forever beyond their grasp. If fin de siècle Afro-American discourse was strategically gendered, that gendering frequently involved interconnected concepts of race and manhood.

A7

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 33-34

In 1890, the state legislature had passed a bill in Louisiana making it a crime for an independent military company to exist without special permission from the Governor. The "Faith Cadets," an independent military company comprised of black men and

operating in New Orleans, was hit hard by the legislation. The company had been organized in August of 1887, and on May 30, 1890, participated in the memorial services of the colored Grand Army of the Republic of Mississippi and Louisiana. Right outside of the city at the Chalmette National Cemetery, the company fired the first volley over the nation's dead. ... Try as they might, the Faith Cadets were never able to secure the proper permit and were forced into hibernation until the outbreak of the War with Spain.*26

*26 Coston, *Spanish-American War Volunteer*, 77. For interesting discussions of military parades and African-American citizenship see Kate Masur, "Reconstructing the Nation's Capital: The Politics of Race and Citizenship in the District of Columbia, 1862-1878" (Ph.D. diss., University of Michigan, 2001). On war and public memory see David W. Blight, *Race and Reunion: The Civil War in American Memory* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2001).

William Hilary Coston, *The Spanish-American War Volunteer*, 2nd ed. (Camp Meade, Middleton, PA: Published by the Author, 1899, 77

When the call for volunteers was made by President McKinley, Lieutenant Nelson was the captain of an independent military company called the "Faith" Cadets," whose motto was Courage and Faith." This company was organized in August, 1887. On May 30, 1890, this company, with others, participated in the memorial services of the colored G. A. R. of Mississippi and Louisiana, at the National Cemetery "Chalmette," when Lieutenant Nelson's company fired the first volley over the nation's dead in that cemetery. But soon a bill was passed in Louisiana making it a crime for an independent military company to exist without a special permission from the Governor. This permit could never be secured, and the company was allowed to sleep quietly on until the call was made.

A8

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 293, 294

on July 10, 1901, David J. Ryanes, a former slave born in Tennessee and long registered voter in New Orleans, presented himself to the supervisor of registration for the parish of Orleans, Jeremiah Gleason. Gleason blocked Ryanes from registering, invoking Article 197 of the 1898 constitution, which permitted registration only by those who could meet property or educational requirements, and those who had entered their names on the permanent registration books in 1898.*128

...

Ryanes, represented by his attorney, filed suit against Supervisor Gleason in the Civil District Court of the parish of Orleans. The District Judge dismissed the case on August 19, 1901, on the grounds of no cause of action*131

*128 Scott, *Degrees*, 192.

*131 Scott, *Degrees*, 192.

Scott 2005, 192

On July 10, 1901, David J. Ryanes, a former slave born in Tennessee and long a registered voter in New Orleans, presented himself to the supervisor of registration for the parish of Orleans, Jeremiah Gleason. Gleason blocked Ryanes from registering, invoking Article 197 of the 1898 constitution, which permitted registration only by those who could meet property or educational requirements and those who had entered their names during 1898 on the “permanent” registration list

...

Ryanes, represented by a local white attorney, Armand Romain, filed suit against Supervisor Gleason in the Civil District Court of the parish of Orleans

...

District Judge Somerville dismissed the case on August 19, 1901, on the grounds of no cause of action

A9

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 118

Ten days before, Ferrer and his men had also set up camp at the Santa Ursula plantation, east of the city of Santiago. Almost immediately the owner expressed outrage at what he saw as their taking his property and Ferrer’s abuse of his employees.*94

*94 Scott, *Degrees*, 175.

Scott 2005,175

Ferrer and his men set up camp on November 4 on the Santa Ursula plantation east of the city of Santiago. Almost immediately the owner expressed outrage at what he saw as their taking of his property and Ferrer's abuse of his employees.

A10

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009 35-36

In addition to passing the election laws, the 1896 legislature also passed legislation calling for elections for a state constitutional convention. With only one Populist and one Republican elected to the convention, the Democrats were free to proceed with their explicitly stated agenda of disfranchising "the ignorant, the vicious, and the degraded classes." The core provision of the new constitution was an educational test designed to exclude 90 percent of voting-age black men. Such a provision could obviously disfranchise both black and white men, and so to mitigate its effect on the white electorate, the convention added a "grandfather clause." Section 5 of article 197 of the new state constitution allowed all qualified men who could testify that they had voted prior to January of 1867 and also their legitimate male heirs to register during the first nine months of 1898. These voters could acquire a permanent right to vote without meeting the literacy and property requirements introduced by the new constitution. Naturalized immigrants could also register to vote without meeting the standard of the grandfather clause. While the other clauses were formally race neutral, the grandfather clause was a blatantly racialized effort to exclude black voters.*30

The lack of federal recourse against such actions encouraged the 1898 Constitutional Convention's disregard for possible reprisals. Though equal-rights activists throughout the country were working to challenge the new state constitution by arguing that it violated the Reconstruction amendments, they were not able to accomplish very much. Even though Booker T. Washington, the "wizard of Tuskegee," wrote to the convention delegates and appealed to them in person, they failed to see his point regarding the efficacy of enforcing only class based limits on the franchise and stopping short of racialized limitations.*31

*30 See coverage in *New Orleans Daily Picayune*, December 5, 9, 11, 1897. Also quoted in Kousser, *Shaping*, 164. For an in-depth discussion of the full proceedings and the biographies of its participants see *Scott, Degrees, Chapter 6, especially 163-5*. For full proceedings of convention see Louisiana, *Official Proceedings of the Constitutional Convention, 1898*.

*31 John F. Patty to Booker T. Washington, Jesuit Bend, LA, July 4, 1898 and Booker T. Washington to the Louisiana Constitutional Convention, Tuskegee, Alabama, February 19, 1898, in Booker T. Washington, Louis R. Harlan, and Raymond Smock, *The Booker T. Washington Papers* 14 vols. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1972), 4: 381-384. See also *Scott, Degrees, 163-4*.

Scott 2005, 161, 163-64

Democrats wanted more than this de facto transformation of the electorate, however. They sought to achieve a classic political “lockup,” in which the formal rules of the game would consolidate their advantage. They shifted from statutory to constitutional stratagems and moved to convene a constitutional convention. Elections to the convention reflected the consequences of the prior statutory limitations: **only one Populist and one Republican were elected to** a gathering composed overwhelmingly of Democrats. The convention began its deliberations in New Orleans in February of 1898.

...

The core provision was an educational test designed to exclude 90 percent of black men of voting age. Further proposals put on the table for discussion were riddled with mean-spirited exclusions, and tortured exceptions from the exclusions. An alternate property qualification would, it was hoped, “preserve the franchise to 5000 or 6000 illiterate whites,” while admitting only 1,000 blacks. **Booker T. Washington** himself, accompanied by one of the few remaining black state legislators, **appealed directly to the Louisiana delegates to content themselves with class limitations on the franchise, rather than blatant proxies for race.** But he failed. **Section 5 of Article 197 of the final document allowed all qualified men who could testify that they had voted prior to January 1867—that is, prior to the congressional extension of the vote to black men—and their legitimate male heirs to register during the first nine months of 1898 and acquire a permanent right to vote, without meeting the literacy and property requirements otherwise introduced by the new constitution.**

A11

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 261

Meanwhile, African Americans in Louisiana, increasingly isolated by restrictions on the vote initiated by the Democrats, were attempting to use what remained of the Republican Party to advance their standing within the country. Louisiana Democrats had first resorted to violent suppression of black voters and then followed it with statutory limits on the franchise. **As a result of the new restrictions on voting passed in 1896, registration figures for the entire state of Louisiana had shown 74,133 white voters and 12,902 colored voters as of January 1898.** The Louisiana Democrats then followed the example set by their counterparts in Mississippi (1890) and South Carolina (1895) and moved forward with their agenda to fully disfranchise black voters in the state via a constitutional convention. **After the implementation of the new 1898 constitution, the number of white voters increased while the number of colored voters was effectively diminished. As of March 1900 the state’s registration books held 125,437 white voters and just 5,320 colored voters***55

*55 **Scott, *Degrees*, 190**. See also Kousser, *Shaping*, 160-67 . See also on disfranchisement conventions in other states Woodward, *Origins of the New South*, chap. 12. Louisiana was followed by North Carolina (1901) by means of an amendment, Alabama (1901), Virginia (1901-2), Georgia by Amendment (1908), and Oklahoma (1910).

Scott 2005, 190

Permanent disfranchisement, however, was not quite a fait accompli in Louisiana in 1900. As a result of the statutory restrictions of 1896, registration figures had shown 74,133 white voters and 12,902 colored voters in the state in January 1898. With the 1898 constitution, the number of white voters was pumped back up, and that of colored voters crushed. As of March 1900, the state's registration books held 125,437 white voters and just 5,320 colored voters. The formal equilibrium of the 1880s and the statutorily imposed disequilibrium of the 1890s had given way to avalanche.

A12

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 33

The offering of services by black men was not novel, but had ironically happened much earlier in Louisiana, and even more ironically at the height of the state's disfranchisement activities. Pierre Carmouche, a blacksmith from Donaldsonville, Louisiana, and former Knights of Labor organizer, had offered his services to the Democratic governor of Louisiana, Murphy Foster, as early as February 26, 1898. That month, Carmouche sent letters to both the Secretary of War and the governor of Louisiana offering his services and those of 250 colored men "on short notice, in defense of our country, at home or abroad."*25

*25 William Hilary Coston, *The Spanish-American War Volunteer*, 2nd ed. (Camp Meade, Middleton, PA: Published by the Author, 1899), 133, 218. For detailed discussion on Carmouche see **Scott, *Degrees*, 162**.

Scott 2005, 3-4

Pierre Carmouche, a blacksmith from Donaldsonville, Louisiana, and a vocal supporter of the Plessy challenge, wrote to the U.S. secretary of war to offer his services and those of 250 other "colored Americans, on short notice, in the defence of our country, at home or abroad."

Scott 2005, 162

On February 15, a week after the disfranchising convention had convened in New Orleans, the U.S. battleship Maine exploded in Havana Harbor. On February 26, Pierre L. Carmouche addressed himself by letter to the Republican secretary of war in Washington and then to Democratic governor Murphy Foster of Louisiana, offering his services and those of 250 men of color of Ascension Parish, "on short notice, in defence of our country, at home or abroad."

A13

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 310-11

When the government announced that a battalion of one hundred black longshoremen from New Orleans would be among the first companies in the American Expeditionary Forces to arrive in France, black labor leaders again rallied for black enlistment. In October of 1917, black draftees assigned to stevedoring regiments, led by a contingent of African American Spanish American War veterans, marched from their union hall to the New Orleans terminal station where an estimated 20,000 black supporters waited to send them off.*168 Later that winter, Du Bois, the editor of the *Crisis* magazine, the official organ of the NAACP, encouraged black Americans to "close ranks"; the time had finally come, he thought, when "we may expect to see the walls of prejudice gradually crumble before the onslaught of common sense and racial progress."*169 And so, as African American political consciousness evolved again under the tutelage of new leadership in a new day, the struggle for racial equality continued.

*168 On Cohen, Vance, and WWI see Arnesen, *Waterfront Workers*, 218; *Times Picayune*, October 8, 1917.

*169 *Crisis* 15 (December 1917), 78; "Close ranks," *Crisis* 16 (July 1918), 111. On Du Bois and WWI see Fairclough, *Better Day Coming*, chap. 5. On post-WWI political views, see David Levering Lewis, *W.E.B. Du Bois: Biography of a Race: 1868-1919*, 1st ed. (New York: H. Holt, 1993), chap. 1.

Eric Arnesen, *Waterfront Workers of New Orleans: Race, Class, and Politics, 1863-1923* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), 218

When the government announced that among the first companies in the American Expeditionary Force to arrive in France would be a battalion of one hundred black longshoremen from New Orleans, black labor leaders sponsored public meetings to encourage black enlistment in stevedoring regiments. In early June, hundreds of blacks gathered to send off the first black longshore volunteers; later, in October, 228 black draftees assigned to stevedoring regiments, led by a contingent of black Spanish-American war veterans, marched from their union hall to the New Orleans Terminal Station. There, an estimated 20,000 city blacks gathered to see them off.*35 Moreover, the black Central Labor Union and ILA locals strongly condemned the alleged "efforts and unscrupulous and uncalled-for activities" by the

IWW along the New Orleans riverfront, in particular at Stuyvesant Docks, the Southern Pacific wharves and the American Sugar Refining Company.*36

*35 *Times-Picayune*, April 8, 12, 18, May 26, June 5—7, 19, July 11, September 7, 11, October 8, 1917 ...

A14

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 35

In 1896, the state legislature moved to “reform” election laws by enforcing secret ballots and barring officials from helping illiterate voters, requiring voters to re-register after January 1, 1897, and empowering registrars (the majority of whom were Democrats), to purge the voting lists at will. The names of those purged from the lists were to be published in the local newspaper. Consequently, unless the purged elector filed a charge against the deletion of his name within five days after the publication, he lost the right to vote. The reform package was pushed through the legislature in time for the upcoming elections, and not surprisingly, brought devastating results. By 1897, the number of black voters in the state had fallen by almost 90 percent.*29

*29 Any two representatives of a political party or the election registrars could purge the voting lists, for whatever reasons. Acts of Louisiana, Sec. 76: 214-15 (1896); Kousser, *Shaping of Southern Politics*, 160-65; Scott, *Degrees*, 160 ; William Ivy Hair, *Bourbonism and Agrarian Protest; Louisiana Politics, 1877-1900* (Baton Rouge, : Louisiana State University Press, 1969), 268.

Arnesen 1991, 147

The consequences for blacks—and poor whites—were severe. In 1896, the state legislature “reformed” the election laws by barring officials from helping illiterate voters, requiring voters to re-register after January 1, 1897, and empowering registrars and representatives of political parties to purge the voting lists. According to Kousser, the registration act reduced the white electorate by more than one-half and the black electorate by 90 percent.

A15

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 30

In early 1898, McKinley had launched efforts to negotiate a peace between Spain and Cuba and transfer the island to the United States. By March 27 he had issued an ultimatum to Spain,

demanding an armistice in hostilities with the Cubans, and promising to use his power to get the insurgents to accept the plan. His efforts were thwarted when Cuban separatist leaders denounced the cease-fire and ordered insurgent forces to continue operations. ... *19

*19 On lead-up to war see Louis A. Pérez, *Cuba between Empires, 1878-1902* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1983), 172-78, especially 78 ; Philip Sheldon Foner, *The Spanish-Cuban-American War and the Birth of American Imperialism, 1895-1902* (New York,: Monthly Review Press, 1972), 230-280, especially 250-3. There is a considerable historiography on the United States, empire, and its involvement in the Cuban-Spanish-American War. See Graham A. Cosmos, *An Army for Empire: The United States Army in the Spanish American War*, 2nd ed. (Shippensburg: White Mane, 1994); David Healy, *U.S. Expansionism: The Imperialist Urge in the 1890s* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1970); Kristin Hoganson, *Fighting for American Manhood: How Gender Politics Provoked the Spanish- American and Philippine-American Wars* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998); Walter LaFeber, *The New Empire: An Interpretation of American Expansion, 1860-1898*, 35th anniversary ed. (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1998); G. J. A. O'Toole, *The Spanish War, an American Epic--1898*, 1st ed. (New York: Norton, 1984).

Pérez, Jr., Louis A. *Cuba Between Empires, 1878-1902*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1983, 172, 177

Efforts to negotiate a peace with Spain based on a transfer of the island to the United States began in earnest in early 1898.

...

In Cuba, separatist army chieftains denounced the cease-fire and ordered insurgent forces to continue operations.

A16

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 93

Again, on August 12, 1898, when the United States entered a unilateral peace agreement with Spain, Cuban insurgents were not included in the talks. As the Americans and the Spanish met in Paris, the rebels convened an assembly in the East at Santa Cruz to discuss Cuba's postwar future.*24 Even though peace was formally declared, insurgent armies in Cuba would continue military operations until consulted. Washington appealed unofficially to Estrada Palma, the new leader of the Partido Revolucionario Cubano (PRC). Hinting of its desire to move ahead with the principles of the Joint Resolution, Washington stressed the need to end hostilities as soon as possible. Three days later, Palma accepted the peace protocols.*25 The fight for independence

seemed to have gone drastically awry. The United States had made it glaringly evident that it intended for the rebel forces to play a limited role in the political reconstruction of the island.

*24 Louis A. Pérez, *Essays on Cuban History: Historiography and Research* (Gainesville: University of Florida Press, 1995), 10-12; Pérez, *Cuba between Empires, 1878-1902*, 206-10. Assembly noted in Scott, *Degrees*, 151.

*25 On this transition see Pérez, *Cuba between Empires, 1878-1902*, 210.

Pérez 1983, 210

On August 12, 1898, the United States and Spain formally ended the "Spanish-American War." Again, the Americans purposefully neglected to include their Cuban allies in the peace negotiations. For the second time in as many months, the United States had negotiated an independent and unilateral settlement with Spanish authorities. Since Cubans were not signatories to the peace protocol, however, insurgent armies in Cuba continued military operations. On August 12, the War Department appealed unofficially to the PRC representation in Washington to secure the Cuban ratification of the armistice. Hinting of its desire to move ahead with the pledge contained in the Joint Resolution, Washington stressed the necessity of ending hostilities in Cuba as quickly as possible.⁸¹ Three days later, Estrada Palma accepted the Spanish-American peace protocol, an accord subsequently ratified in Cuba by the provisional government.

A17

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 105

The August protocols had divided the urban centers between the Spanish and the Americans, leaving the vast majority of the 50,000 Cuban officers and men encamped in the countryside. Accustomed to living off of the land, depending on supplies from abroad, and exacting levies from merchants and landowners, the economically devastated army of liberation was relegated to fending for themselves in the countryside. ... *62

*62 Pérez, *Essays on Cuban History: Historiography and Research*, 14.

Pérez 1983, 231

The August protocol resulted in dividing control of the island's urban centers between Spanish and American forces, leaving fifty thousand Cuban officers and men confined to a countryside devastated by three years of war. Throughout the war, the insurgent forces had lived off the land, dependent on supplies and provisions arriving from abroad and levies exacted locally.

A18

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 112

The passage of **Civil Order No. 62** in 1899 would provide the legal basis to overturn traditional forms of tenure and tenancy in the East. **Promulgated for the purpose of cleaning up the confusion over titles**, it facilitated the consolidation of **smaller properties**, clearing the way for land **concentration**. **The 90,960 plantations and farms in Cuba before the war diminished to 60,710 after 1899**.^{*81} But in the meantime, individuals like Emilio Beltrán, who had moved onto the Norma Plantation in Santiago, would successfully petition the local military authorities to recognize their rights to official possession of abandoned estates. While the record has heretofore proven silent on the process by which Beltrán was able to claim the property, by November of 1898, he managed to become the recognized owner of a sugarhouse in San Luís.^{*82}

^{*81} On movement by veterans onto abandoned lands see Pérez, *Lords of the Mountain*, chap. 4; Scott, *Degrees*, 175-86, and Scott and Zeuske, "Property in Writing": 686-70. On Civil Order no. 62, **see Pérez, *Cuba between Empires*, 359**.

^{*82} On Emilio Beltran see C.D. Wood to Assistant Adjutant General of Brigade, San Luis, Cuba, October 8, 1898, Ninth USV, Regimental Letters Sent, RG 94, USNA; and Court Martial of U.S. vs John Williams, Santiago, May 20, 1899, RG 153, Box 81, Entry 17, No. 11256, USNA, hereafter referred to as U.S. vs. John Williams, May 20, 1899, No. 11256.

Pérez 1983, 359

Civil Order No. 62 later that year, **promulgated for the purpose of "cleaning up the mess of titles that has entangled the properties"** of communal farms, also gave impetus for **concentration**. **The 90,960 plantations and farms in Cuba before the war diminished to 60,710 after 1899**. Many of the titles of these **smaller properties** were hopelessly tied up in confused ownership and unclear possession.

A19

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 83

On May 25, 1898, the steamer *Florida*, which was escorted by the U.S. warship *Osceola*, landed on the north coast of Oriente de Cuba with 500 Springfield rifles, bullets, and 300 recruits for the Ejército Libertador (Cuban Liberation Army). Aboard the ship was Ramón Pagés, a "Spanish" cigar maker who had been residing in New Orleans and who had appeared at an equal rights

meeting organized by New Orleans activists Rodolph Desdunes and Louis Martinet. Also aboard the vessel were two Cuban activists of color, Martín Morúa Delgado and Generoso Campos Marquetti, both of whom would play pivotal roles in both the Liberation Army and post-revolutionary politics in Cuba.*1 From the beginning of the final War for Cuban Independence, bands of Cuban exiles from within the United States had been traveling from off the coast of Florida and delivering goods to the Cuban insurgents. By April of 1898, after the formal declaration of hostilities between Spain and the United States, the trips that Cuban patriots living abroad had been taking clandestinely began occurring in the open, offering émigrés such as Pagés, Morúa, and Campos the opportunity to return to the Revolution.*3

*1 For the list of expeditionaries see Miguel Varona Guerrero, *La Guerra de Independencia de Cuba, 1895-1898*, 3 vols. (Havana: Editorial Lex, 1946): 2:1360-61. For discussion of Ramón Pagés, see Rebecca J. Scott, *Degrees of Freedom: Louisiana and Cuba after Slavery* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2005), 76-77. On the equal rights meeting where Pagés appeared see Louis A. Martinet, ed, *The Violation of a Constitutional Right. Published by Authority of the Citizens' Committee* (New Orleans: The Crusader, 1896). Martín Morúa Delgado, a nationalist writer of color, wrote extensively on Cuban nationalism and the role black insurgents would play in the revolution. See Ada Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868-1898* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1999), 124, 132-33. On Generoso Campos Marquetti and his leadership within Afro-Cuban and national level politics well into the 1950's see index entry under Generoso Campos Marquetti in Alejandro de la Fuente, *A Nation for All: Race, Inequality, and Politics in Twentieth-Century Cuba* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001). On exile communities see Poyo, "With All, and for the Good of All": *The Emergence of Popular Nationalism in the Cuban Communities of the United States, 1848- 1898* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1989).

*3 Scott, *Degrees*, 76-77. Alger recounts a similar expedition occurring at the end of May in his memoir of the war, but claims that the insurgents received 7,500 Springfield rifles, 1,300,000 rounds of .45 caliber ammunition, and 20,000 rations. Alger, *The Spanish-American War*, 43.

Scott 2005, 151

On May 25, 1898, for example, the steamer Florida, escorted by the U.S. warship Osceola, landed on the north coast of Oriente with 500 Springfield rifles, a million bullets, and 300 recruits for the Cuban rebel army. The Cuban force was under the command of the veteran rebel general José Lacret Morlot, and included doctors, dentists, pharmacists, and foot soldiers. Lieutenant Martín Morúa Delgado, a man of color from Santa Clara who worked as a clerk, was among them. So was Ramón Pagés, the cigar maker who had spoken up in favor of universal "public rights" at an equal rights meeting in New Orleans convened by Louis Martinet and Rodolphe Desdunes five years earlier. The Louisiana activists who had organized the Plessy challenge had followed the progress of the war in Cuba in the pages of their newspaper, The Crusader. Now at least one participant in the debates in New Orleans would join the Cuban struggle on the ground.

A20

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 296-97

As Armand Romain prepared to take Ryanes' appeal before the Louisiana Supreme Court, the federal Supreme Court was hearing the Alabama voting rights case of *Giles v. Harris*. Jackson Giles, a black man who worked in the federal courthouse in Montgomery, Alabama, had sought through the federal courts to be reinstated on the electoral rolls after being excluded under the new 1901 Alabama Constitution. In April of 1903, the U.S. Supreme Court ruled against Giles, declaring his case to be an inappropriate attempt to "enforce political rights," as opposed to constitutionally protected civil rights. In March of 1904, the Supreme Court also ruled against Giles' second case in which he attempted to sue the registrar for damages.*139

Within days of the second ruling, Romain presented the case of David Ryanes to the Louisiana Supreme Court. Again, the judge in the case had been a member of the state disfranchising convention. This time, the defense team assembled for Supervisor Gleason had the added benefit of the recent ruling in the Giles cases; they could argue that the United States Supreme Court had now walked away from the Fifteenth Amendment. Defense counsel assured the court that each of the qualifications for voters could, in principle, exclude not only black but also white men. The Judge professed to be convinced of their race-neutrality and rejected David Ryanes' appeal. The activists were out of options. There was no reason to appeal to the Supreme Court; the high Court had already made it perfectly clear through the Giles verdicts that it would not render a judgment against the state constitutions.*140

*139 *Giles v. Harris* 189 U.S. 475 (1903). *Scott, Degrees, 195*; and Pildes, "Democracy, Anti-Democracy, and the Canon." The second Alabama case making its way through the courts was *Giles v. Teasley* in which Giles attempted to win a case for damages against the registrar. The new case was argued in January of 1904. *Giles v. Teasley* 193 U.S. 146 (1904). For public opinion on the decision, see *Cleveland Gazette*, February 27, 1904, July 30, 1904.

*140 *Scott, Degrees, 196*. *State ex rel. Ryanes v. Gleason*, Supervisor, 112 La. 612.

Scott 2005, 195-96

As Armand Romain prepared to appeal Ryanes's case to the Louisiana Supreme Court, a crucial Alabama voting rights case, *Giles v. Harris*, was making its way toward a hearing in the U.S. Supreme Court. Jackson Giles, a black man who worked in the federal courthouse in Montgomery, Alabama, had sought through the federal courts to be reinstated on the electoral rolls after being excluded under the new 1901 Alabama Constitution. On April 27, 1903, the U.S. Supreme Court turned Giles back, judging his case to be an inappropriate appeal to "enforce political rights," as opposed to constitutionally protected civil rights.

...

Giles was now trying to win a case for damages against the registrar. The new case was *Giles v. Teasley*, and was argued in January of 1904. ...

...

Kruttschnitt and the other attorneys for Gleason simply piled up the evidence that the U.S. Supreme Court itself had now walked away from the Fifteenth Amendment. ...

...

In arguing against Ryanes's claim in the Louisiana Supreme Court, Kruttschnitt and his colleagues skirted the question of racially biased intent—on which the 1898 constitutional convention debates were very clear—by noting the lower court's ruling that such evidence was irrelevant and immaterial. The Louisiana authorities then blandly assured the court that each of the qualifications for voters could, in principle, exclude not only black but also white men. Very recently naturalized foreigners and white men whose grandfathers were not eligible to vote in 1867, for example, could not invoke the grandfather clause. Chief Justice Frank A. Monroe, like Judge St. Paul a former member of the constitutional convention, professed to be thus convinced of the race-neutrality of the rules. Monroe also noted that the framers of the Louisiana Constitution had "not thought proper" to include cases of refusal of permission to register among the enumerated civil or political rights for which there was a right of appeal to the Supreme Court. The actions of local supervisors of registration were final. Ryanes's appeal was rejected.

The strategy of judicial challenge had, in effect, reached a dead end. With the U.S. Supreme Court categorically on record in the Giles cases, there was no point in appealing the Ryanes case further.

A21

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 108

The Revolution had begun in the East, where the effects of economic crisis and the political quest for independence resonated more loudly with planters than it did in the West where prosperity rested on sugar and slavery. In eastern Cuba, which had smaller numbers of slaves and did not rely heavily on sugar or slavery, planters were willing to risk the social upheaval an armed independence movement might bring. Leaders of the first War for Independence—Antonio Maceo, Agustín Cebreco, José Maceo, and others—had managed to forge a coalition between planters, liberated slaves, and peasants. By the time the war had run its course, the insurgents had built a coalition throughout the island that crossed all social classes.*69 And

some of those who participated in banditry had also become soldiers in the Cuban Army. In the words of Máximo Gómez, “The Liberation Army” had, “in the beginning, gathered all who offered their services, even the bandits.”*70

*69 Pérez, *Cuba between Empires, 1878-1902*, 127.

*70 Gómez quoted in Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba*, 179.

Ferrer, A. (2005). *Insurgent Cuba: Race, Nation, and Revolution, 1868-1898*. United Kingdom: University of North Carolina Press, 21

In the west, where the fortunes of the most important landowners were inextricably tied to the product of slaves' labor, planters did not dare arm themselves, their neighbors, or their slaves to challenge an established and, for them, lucrative political order. By contrast, in the eastern regions that produced the initial uprising—where a majority of the population was white and where the most prominent landowners did not rely as heavily on sugar or slavery—planters were willing to risk the social upheaval an armed independence movement might bring.

A22

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 141

After the end of the Ten Years' War, the colonial government, in an effort to minimize the threat of future insurrections, created settlements (*poblados*) of former insurgents, many of them surrendered slave insurgents.*153

*153 Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba*, 73.

Ferrer 2005, 73

At the end of the first war, the colonial government, in an effort to minimize the threat of future insurrections, created new settlements (*poblados*) of former insurgents, many of them surrendered slave-insurgents.

A23

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 302

Many years later, Carmouche would write to Booker T. Washington, expressing his satisfaction with the relative lack of racial discrimination in the North. ... *155

*155 Pierre Carmouche to Booker T. Washington, Harlan and Smock, eds. *Booker T. Washington Papers*, 12: 61-2.

Booker T. Washington, Harlan and Smock, eds. *Booker T. Washington Papers*, 12: 64
He continued to correspond with BTW, expressing his satisfaction with the relative lack of racial discrimination in the North

A24

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 272

Social tensions increased as African American migrants moved North in the post 1890 era, causing many to experience outright hostility and even racial violence. A series of ugly riots flared in half a dozen northern cities between 1900 and 1908.*83

*83 McPherson, *Abolitionist Legacy*, 310; Gilbert Osofsky, *Harlem: The Making of a Ghetto*, 2nd ed. (New York: Harper & Row, 1966), 35-52.

McPherson, J. M. (1995). *The Abolitionist Legacy: From Reconstruction to the NAACP*. United Kingdom: Princeton University Press, 310

Racial hatred festered, clashes between black and white became more frequent, and ugly riots flared in a half dozen northern cities between 1900 and 1908.

A25

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 38-39

In 1898, some considered Demas the leading McKinley-man in Louisiana, and it seems that he took the lead in generating support for a regiment of soldiers from New Orleans. Demas had been the "political boss" of Saint John the Baptist Parish for nearly three decades. Born a slave, he had enlisted in the Union army in 1864 and served as a sergeant in the Eightieth United States Colored Infantry. He was educated in the army schools, and for the next three decades remained active in politics, serving in the state House of Representatives, 1870-74 and 1879-80, the Senate, 1876-80 and 1884-92, and serving as a delegate to the 1879 constitutional convention as well.*38

Like other black Republicans in the state, Demas was gradually being excluded from state politics, but he remained an active figure in New Orleans and national politics throughout the 1890's. In the violent political climate of Louisiana society, Demas had also been a direct victim of racial violence. He was a delegate-at-large to the Republican convention of 1896. Moreover, when local black voters gave him the ballot box to protect, local white vigilantes backed by armed Louisiana militia units besieged his house and forced him to surrender it. In the weeks leading up to the official declaration of war, the Senate commerce committee unanimously rejected Demas as the President's appointment for Naval Officer of New Orleans. He had become the object of a bitter fight, which the *Gazette* referred to as an "outgrowth of southern prejudice."*39

*38 Eric Foner, *Freedom's Lawmakers : A Directory of Black Officeholders During Reconstruction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 61; Charles Vincent, *Black Legislators in Louisiana During Reconstruction* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1976), 116-117.

*38 Foner, *Freedom's Lawmakers*, 61 ; *Cleveland Gazette*, March 12, 1898.

Eric Foner, *Freedom's Lawmakers : A Directory of Black Officeholders During Reconstruction* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 61

Born in Saint John the Baptist Parish, Louisiana, the slave of a physician, Demas enlisted in the Union army in 1864, serving as sergeant in Company H, 80th U.S. Colored Infantry. He was educated at army schools. For nearly three decades, he was his parish's political "boss." His first office was constable, in 1869. Demas then served in the state House of Representatives, 1870-74 and 1879-80, and in the Senate, 1876- 80 and 1884-92. He also held office on the parish school board, and, from 1871 to 1880, as parish treasurer. He was also a delegate to the 1879 constitutional convention. For a time, he also served as a naval officer in the port of New Orleans. Demas ran unsuccessfully for Congress in 1882. Demas's parish was one of the last to be "redeemed" by white Democrats. In 1896, local whites, backed by Louisiana militia units armed with field artillery, besieged his house and forced him to surrender the ballot box, which blacks had taken there.

A26

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 183n86

By the end of the nineteenth century the "Negro" problem had become thoroughly medicalized. As tuberculosis metamorphosed from a "white folks disease" to a "Negro disease," the "Negro problem" became firmly entrenched in scientific and medical thought. See Hunter, *To 'Joy My Freedom*, 195; McBride, *From TB to AIDS*, 16-22; For broader historiography see Haller, "The Physician Versus the Negro."

Hunter 1997, 195

By the end of the nineteenth century the "Negro problem" had become thoroughly medicalized, thanks to the persistence and transformation of pro-slavery arguments and to new discoveries in epidemiology that bolstered white Southern attitudes. As tuberculosis metamorphosed from a "white folks' disease" to a "Negro disease," the "Negro problem" became firmly established in scientific and medical thought.

A27

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 16

Cubans of all colors and social origins had created a formidable cross-racial, cross-class alliance, and forged a nationalist ideology in which all, regardless of race and social status, became equal members in the new nation.*21

*21 Alejandro de la Fuente, *A Nation for All : Race, Inequality, and Politics in Twentieth-Century Cuba* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 23-45. On the possibilities, limitations, and challenges involved in the building of Cuban nationalist ideology, see Fuente, *Ibid.* See also Fernando Martínez Heredia, "Nationalism, Racism, and Classes in the Revolution of 1895 and the Cuban First Republic," *Cuban Studies* 33 (2002):95-123; Ferrer, *Insurgent Cuba*, Introduction; Helg, *Our Rightful Share*, 68-90. On Martí in particular see Paul Estrade, *José Martí: Los fundamentos de la democracia en Latino America* (Aranjuez, Spain: Ediciones Doce Calles, 2000).

Alejandro de la Fuente, *A Nation for All : Race, Inequality, and Politics in Twentieth-Century Cuba* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 23

In a long process involving three separate wars and thirty years of struggle, Cubans of all colors and social origins had created a formidable cross-racial coalition and forged a nationalist revolutionary ideology that claimed all Cubans were equal members of the nation, regardless of race or social status.

A28

Sherri Ann Charleston 2009, 46n58

Gatewood Jr., *Black Americans*, 98. For discussion of debates regarding immunity and enlistment see Fletcher, "The Black Volunteers in the Spanish-American War," 48-49.

Modern science has answered many of the questions regarding immunity that were debated in the antebellum and late-nineteenth century. Some African Americans did possess an inherited resistance to one or another form of malaria via the presence of a gene for the sickle cell trait. For African Americans and Caucasians without natural resistance to a particular type of plasmodium (the organism that causes malaria), it was possible to acquire malarial immunity by suffering repeated exposure from the same plasmodium type over several years. Todd Lee Savitt, "Black Health on the Plantation: Masters, Slaves, and Physicians," in *Sickness and Health in America: Readings in the History of Medicine and Public Health* ed. Judith W. Leavitt and Ronald L. Numbers (Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1997), 32-35. But immunity to malaria was far from absolute. African Americans showed high rates of infection and mortality during and after the war. On race and malarial immunity see Margaret Humphreys, *Malaria: Poverty, Race, and Public Health in the United States* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001), 13-20, 47-48, 57-64, 68. For theoretical analysis of the uses of immunity and empire see Warwick Anderson, "Immunities of Empire: Race, Disease, and the New Tropical Medicine, 1900-1920," *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 70, no. 1 (1996):94-118, particularly 62-64; Warwick Anderson, "Disease, Race, and Empire," *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 70, no. 1 (1996): 62-67, particularly 95-101. The issue was widely debated in the Nineteenth century, see William Sykes, "Negro Immunity from Malaria and Yellow Fever In "Correspondence," *The British Medical Journal* (1905):389-90; Captain Fred Smith, "Malaria: Immunity: Absence of Negro Immunity: Variety," *The British Medical Journal* (Dec. 17, 1898): 7.

Todd Lee Savitt, "Black Health on the Plantation: Masters, Slaves, and Physicians," in *Sickness and Health in America: Readings in the History of Medicine and Public Health* ed. Judith W. Leavitt and Ronald L. Numbers (Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1997), 352

Modern science has answered many of the questions of immunity and prevention of malaria with which doctors and planters struggled in the antebellum period. Several factors contributed to the phenomenon of malarial immunity. As will be discussed below, many blacks did possess an inherited immunity to one or another form of malaria. But for Caucasians and those Negroes without natural resistance to a particular plasmodium (the organism that causes malaria) type, it was possible to acquire malarial immunity or tolerance only ... by suffering repeated infections of the disease over a period of several years.

Part B

Sherri Ann Charleston's only peer reviewed article, co-authored with LaVar Charleston and Jerlando Jackson, was published in 2014 in the *Journal of Negro Education*. But close to 20% of the 2014 paper was published before in a 2012 paper by LaVar Charleston in the *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, including much of the language used to describe the study, its methods, and its results. Yet despite this, I see no acknowledgement in the 2014 study that it is substantially a reprint of the 2012 journal article by LaVar Charleston. About 2/3 of the section

entitled “Findings” in the 2014 paper was previously published as the “Conclusion” to the 2012 paper (see item B10 below). What the 2012 study described as its “major findings” are practically identical to what the 2014 study described as its “results” (see item B12 below). The description of the study participants is also the same across both papers, as are a number of long-form testimonies from participants treated as “data.” For example

The participants in the 2012 were described as follows (225):

- “A total of 37 individual interviews were conducted”
- Interviews “ranged from 30 to 45 min”
- “22% of interviewees were undergraduate students”
- “48% were graduate students”
- “30% were PhD-minted professors or researchers”
- “50% of all participants either attended or were in the process of attending predominantly White institutions”
- “42% attended historically Black colleges and universities”
- “8% attended predominantly Black institutions”
- “The average participant age was 28.5 years”

The participants in the 2014 were then described as follows (406):

- “Thirty-seven computing sciences aspirants and practitioners were interviewed”
- “Interviews ranged from 30 to 45 minutes”
- “22 percent were undergraduate students”
- “48 percent were graduate students”
- “30 percent were PhD-minted professors or researchers.”
- “50 percent of all participants either attended or were in the process of attending predominantly White institutions”
- “42 percent attended historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs)”
- “8 percent attended predominantly Black institutions.”
- “The average participant age was 29 years.”

Also for example, the 2014 and 2012 study both report that a participant answered an interview question thusly:

One of my friends started teaching me about programming C++. The next semester I took an intro to programming . . . As an undergrad, I was an applied mathematics person. My friend told me to join the Olympiad (Computing and Robotics) team...

In fact the 2014 study presents itself as original research filling a gap in the literature, saying on page 403:

“Despite these findings, there is still a scarcity of research regarding specific, culturally relevant-practices that successfully engage African American students and steer them toward entering computer sciences pipeline. This study sought to bridge this gap. In doing so, this study was guided by the following research question: What factors contributed to the successful pursuit and persistence of African Americans in the computing science educational and occupational pipeline?”

In the 2012 study LaVar wrote on page 224:

“Within the body of literature that pertains to African American involvement in STEM fields, very few results have been reported on other programs or interventions that target this demographic as it relates to computing science. ... As such, the primary research question within this study was as follows: “What key factors contribute to African Americans’ pursuit of computing science degrees?”

Further, the 2014 paper lifts many pages of text from LaVar Charleston’s 2012 paper and others without proper attribution. Below, to clarify, I highlight correct and incorrect but relevant references in red. Where there is no red highlight, it is because I can find no relevant citation at all in the Charleston passage.

B1

Sherri Ann Charleston, LaVar J. Charleston, Jerlando Jackson. “Using Culturally Responsive Practices to Broaden Participation in the Educational Pipeline: Addressing the Unfinished Business of Brown in the Field of Computing Sciences” *Journal of Negro Education*, Volume 83, Number 3, Summer 2014, p. 405.

Stassen (2003) found that living-learning program participants had higher first-semester GPAs, tended to persist more readily from the first to the second year, and reported higher levels of institutional commitment and integration into the institution’s academic systems than non-participants. Pike (1999) found gains in intellectual development, a point further supported by Inkelas and Weisman (2003) who noted living-learning program participants reported greater gains in critical thinking skills and greater enjoyment of challenging intellectual pursuits than resident students who were not participating in a living learning program. Another benefit is that in many living-learning programs, faculty members teach courses directly in students’ residence halls. According to Johnson and others (2006), in doing so, opportunities for both formal and informal interaction are maximized. Additionally, students who participated in living-learning programs were more likely to report that their residence hall was academically and socially supportive than those who were not in living-learning programs, and they reported a greater number of discussions with their peers around academic and social issues than non-participants. Similarly, living-learning participants reported more frequent instances of faculty

mentorship than those students who were not in living- learning programs (Johnson et al., 2006).

Johnson, D., Soldner, M., & Inkelas, K. K. (2006, June). *Facilitating success for Women in STEM through living-learning programs*. National Conference of the Women in Engineering Programs and Advocates Network, Pittsburgh, PA, 3, 2-3, 4

Stassen (2003) found that participants had higher first-semester GPAs, tended to persist more readily from the first to the second year, and reported higher levels of institutional commitment and integration with the institution's academic systems than non-participants. Pike (1999) found gains in intellectual development, a point further supported by Inkelas and Weisman (2003) who noted living- learning participants reported greater gains in critical thinking skills and greater enjoyment of challenging intellectual pursuits than resident students who were not participating in a living- learning program.

Of the many benefits espoused by living- learning programs, some of the most consistently offered are those that relate to increased faculty and peer interactions. In many living-learning programs, faculty members teach courses directly in students' residence hall. In doing so, opportunities for both formal and informal interaction are maximized (Pike, 1999). Students who participated in living- learning programs were more likely to report that their residence hall was academically and socially supportive than those who were not in living-learning programs, and they reported a greater number of discussions with their peers around academic and social issues than non-participants. Interestingly, living-learning participants reported more frequent instances of faculty mentorship than those students who were not in living- learning programs.

B2

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 407

Using Strauss' (1995) constant comparison method, emergent themes were analyzed after all data were collected through participant interviews. Themes of particular interest to the researchers were those associated with elucidating the research question for this study. The themes were labeled and described independently by two researchers. These themes and their descriptions were cross- verified by the researchers together, re-labeled, and defined. Each researcher then re-examined the original transcripts for separate verification of the presence of the emergent themes. Original transcripts from these data were extracted as supportive evidence for the existence of each theme. The researchers combined findings from the separate analyses to produce a final description of each theme, along with their properties and dimensions.

Jackson, J. F. L., & Daniels, B. D. A pilot study of the workplace experiences for White student affairs professionals at historically Black colleges and universities: Implications for organizational culture and future research. *NASAP Journal*, 8(1), 2006, 33

Using Conrad's (1982) constant comparison method, emergent themes were analyzed after all data were submitted to the web-based data collection site. Themes of particular interest to the researchers were those associated with elucidating the research question for this study. These themes were labeled and described independently by the two researchers. These themes and their descriptions were then cross-verified by the researchers together, re-labeled, and defined. Each researcher then re-examined the original transcripts for separate verification of the presence of the emergent themes. Original transcripts from these data were extracted as supportive evidence for the existence of each theme. The researchers combined findings from the separate analyses to produce a final description of each theme, along with their properties and dimensions.

B3

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 407-408

Coding was an integral part of analysis within this study. Through first-level coding, data were extracted and placed into many themes and meaning categories, which enabled the researcher to summarize portions of data (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). Additionally, analyzing the data through codes achieved the goal of dissecting the interview data in a meaningful way, which in turn helped the researcher maintain the relationships of thematic representations (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Through the coding process, the emergence of categories and their theoretical underpinnings began to align and make sense. The theoretical implications that gradually formed from the categories that created meaning formed relative patterns. Strauss and Corbin (1990) posited that pattern coding enables the placement of first-level coding into more concise themes. Similarly, the patterns and thematic representations that emerge embody grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). When all the incidents were readily classified and the categories were saturated as represented through the emergence of much regularity, the researcher concluded the data collection and analysis portion of the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

LaVar J. Charleston. *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education* 2012 Vol. 5, No. 4, A Qualitative Investigation of African Americans Decision to Pursue Computing Science Degrees: Implications for Cultivating Career Choice and Aspiration, 225

Open coding was an integral part of analysis in this study. Through first-level coding, I extracted data and placed them in many themes and meaning categories, which enabled me to summarize portions of the data (A. C. Strauss & Corbin, 1990). In addition, analyzing the data through codes achieved the goal of dissecting the interview data in a meaningful way, which in

turn helped maintain the relationships of thematic representations (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Through the coding process, the emergence of categories and their theoretical underpinnings began to align and make sense. The theoretical implications that gradually came from the categories that created meaning formed relative patterns. A. C. Strauss and Corbin (1990) posit that pattern coding enables the placement of first-level coding into more concise themes. Likewise, the patterns and thematic representations that emerge embody grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). When all the incidents were readily classified and the categories were saturated as represented through the emergence of much regularity, I concluded the data collection and analysis portion of the study (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; A. L. Strauss, 1987).

B4

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 407

Validity

In an effort to address reliability and validity of the qualitative inquiry within this study, the researchers employed a naturalistic approach. While traditional empirical research addresses validity in terms of reliability, internal validity, and external validity of measures and procedures, the corresponding terms in naturalistic inquiry include audibility, credibility, and fittingness (Guba & Lincoln, 1981). Reliability in qualitative research involves the ability to replicate the study given a similar set of circumstances. Through naturalistic inquiry, the raw data ascertained by the researcher were coded in a manner whereby the contrived themes and theories are not only understood by another individual, but that individual is also able to arrive at a similar conclusion through the consistencies of the coded raw data.

Credibility within this study, in concert with naturalistic inquiry, was achieved by corroborating the structures that made up the study. More plainly, corroboration was ascertained by spending ample time with study participants to check for distortions, which facilitated prolonged engagement with study participants. Consequently, the participants' experiences were explored in sufficient detail that exemplified persistent observation. Additionally, multiple data sources were checked through comparing various forms of data such as digital audio recordings, physical transcriptions, consultation with other investigators, as well as researcher notes. The aforementioned processes of prolonged engagement, persistent observations, and checking multiple data sources embody the process of triangulation. Rudestam and Newton (1992) asserted that peer debriefing, revising working hypotheses throughout the data collection process, clarifying preliminary findings with study participants, and audio-/videotaping the interviews in an effort to compare to other means of data collected are customarily the procedures used to ensure the credibility of a study. Through the current study's primary method of individual interviews, triangulation occurred through corroborating persistent observations, checking multiple sources of data through an in-depth literature

review, recording field notes, and the clarification of categories and narrative stories among study participants. These processes fostered structural corroboration of the study.

Charleston 2012, 226

Validity and Trustworthiness

In an effort to address reliability and validity of the qualitative inquiry within this study, I employed a naturalistic approach. Whereas traditional empirical research addresses validity in terms of reliability, internal validity, and external validity of measures and procedures, the corresponding terms in naturalistic inquiry include audibility, credibility, and fittingness (Guba & Lincoln, 1981). Reliability in qualitative research involves the ability to replicate the study given a similar set of circumstances. Through naturalistic inquiry, I coded the raw data in a manner whereby the contrived themes and theories are not only understood by another individual, but that the individual is able to arrive at a similar conclusion through the consistencies of the coded raw data.

Credibility in this study, in concert with naturalistic inquiry, was achieved by corroborating the structures that made up the study. More plainly, corroboration was ascertained by spending ample time with study participants to check for distortions, which facilitated prolonged engagement with study participants. Likewise, the participants' experiences were explored in sufficient detail, which exemplified persistent observation. In addition, multiple data sources were checked by comparing various forms of data such as digital audio recordings, physical transcriptions, and consultation with other investigators, as well as researcher notes. The aforementioned processes of prolonged engagement, persistent observations, and checking multiple data sources embody the process of triangulation. Rudestam and Newton (1992) assert that peer debriefing, revising working hypotheses throughout the data collection process, clarifying preliminary findings with study participants, and audio-/videotaping the interviews in an effort to compare with other means of data collected are customarily the procedures necessary to ensure the credibility of a study. Through the current study's primary method of individual interviews, triangulation occurred through corroborating persistent observations, checking multiple sources of data through an in-depth literature review, recording field notes, and clarifying categories and narratives among study participants. These processes fostered structural corroboration of the study.

B5

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 408

Positionality

This study was designed in an attempt to make meaning of African American participants' experiences throughout the course of their STEM education trajectory. As such, the authors repeatedly reflected on their own positionality and the impact of their complex racial, gender, and socioeconomic status, as well as educational identity of the interactions with participants and the interpretation of the resultant data. Moreover, inductive data strategies were employed, allowing the data to serve as the foundation of understanding while the findings are acutely descriptive and conveyed through direct quotes and thematic analyses.

Charleston 2012, 226

Positionality

This study was designed as a qualitative inquiry into the educational and occupational trajectories of African Americans into the field of computing sciences in an attempt to make meaning of participants' experiences throughout the course of their education. As such, I repeatedly reflected on my own positionality and the impact of my own complex racial, gender, and socioeconomic status, as well as educational identity with regard to interactions with participants and the interpretation of the resultant data. Moreover, I employed inductive data strategies, allowing the data to serve as the foundation of understanding wherein the findings are acutely descriptive and conveyed through direct quotes and thematic analyses.

B6

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 414

Familial cultivation and encouragement was very instrumental in the trajectories of the study participants. Parental support in the form of verbal and moral encouragement, educational encouragement, and opportunity-seeking (e.g., science and computer clubs), as well as financial support (e.g., computer purchasing) has an integral effect on students' disposition toward mathematics, sciences, and computing. It is the support of parents and surrogate parents that motivate young African Americans to succeed in the computing sciences. Even where parental predispositions were not geared toward computing, positive encouragement proved to enable the participants and foster their aspirations in computing. The purchase of computers and computer-related products for use in the home benefits young African Americans and enhances the likelihood of computing aspirations. However, where finances do not permit, verbal and moral encouragement serve as a technological incubator, if the individual has access to computers elsewhere. Essentially, access to technology is a significant factor for generating interest in and facility with computers.

Charleston 2012, 235

Parental nurturing was very instrumental in the trajectories of the study participants. Parental support in the form of verbal and moral encouragement, educational encouragement, and

opportunity seeking (e.g., science and computer clubs), as well as financial support (e.g., computer purchasing) has an integral effect on students' disposition toward mathematics, sciences, and computing. It is the support of parents that motivates young African Americans to succeed in the computing sciences. Even where parental predisposition was not geared toward computing, positive encouragement proved to enable the participants, perpetuating their aspirations in computing. The purchase of computers and computer-related products for use in the home benefits young African Americans and enhances the likelihood of computing aspirations. However, where finances do not permit, verbal and moral encouragement serves as a technological incubator if the individual has access to computers elsewhere. Essentially, access to technology is significant to the technological incubation phase.

B7

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 415

While the home serves as the first line of technological incubation, schools can and do play a significant role in nurturing African Americans toward science, technology, and computing-related interests. The participants within this study often cited schools as their first introduction to computers. As such, the school is an ideal place to begin the trajectory toward STEM-related fields and disciplines. Schools must reach beyond facilitating remedial engagement with computers (simply consuming information as oppose to creating it), and move toward encouraging and facilitating advanced engagement. Teachers shape children's lives and often serve as role models. When teachers encourage and facilitate technology use in the class room, it not only has the ability to enhance the learning outcomes of students, it also exposes them to technology and its variety of uses, which has the potential to spark an interest in computing sciences and other STEM fields. When teachers facilitate the creation of information and knowledge, African American students become exposed to computing, thereby sparking their interest in the field.

Charleston 2012, 234

Although the home serves as the first line of technological incubation, the school plays a significant role in nurturing African Americans toward technology and computing. The participants in this study often cited schools as their first introduction to computers. School is an ideal place to begin the trajectory toward computing sciences. However, schools must reach beyond encouraging remedial engagement with computers and move toward increasing advanced engagement. Teachers shape children's lives and, often, the teachers serve as role models for students. When teachers encourage and facilitate technology use in the classroom, it not only enhances the learning outcome of students, it also exposes them to technology and its variety of uses, which has the propensity to spark an interest in computing sciences. When teachers facilitate the creation of information and knowledge, African American students become exposed to computing, thus sparking their interest in the field.

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 415

Computing sciences is a White, male-dominated field that encompasses many constructs that are foreign to African American life. These constructs range from technical application methods to social construction. As such, the best chance of persistence among African Americans is to make use of peers as academic and social resources. Positive community building and culturally relevant practices through the educational trajectory minimizes alienation and isolation within the field. The development of a sense of belonging and community improves prospects of degree attainment, cultivating a sense of accountability among African American students.

The field of computing sciences is associated with a variety of stigmas, which serve as deterrents for potential African American contributors. Some of these stigmas include the idea that computing sciences is for nerds, only for White people, only for geniuses, or that in order to participate in computing, it is necessary to be isolated in a cubicle and buried under work. Therefore, the anomaly of participating in advanced level computing demands a robust support network. Add the social isolation that comes with being an anomaly (African American) in an already isolated field (computing sciences or other STEM fields), and the necessity of culturally relevant practices and pedagogy becomes more apparent. Participation in a community around computing is often the deciding factor determining persistence in challenging domains such as computing sciences. As such, cohort-building and participation in a community of practice or a living-learning community is an essential recommendation stemming from results of this investigation and its implications.

Charleston 2012, 236

Computing sciences is a White male-dominated field and, as such, encompasses many constructs that are foreign to African American life. These constructs range from technical application methods to social construction. The best chance for persistence among African Americans is to make use of peers as academic and social resources. The cohort model minimizes alienation and isolation within the field of computing sciences. Likewise, cohorts contribute to the prospect of degree attainment as there is a sense of accountability that is built among African American members.

The field of computing sciences is associated with a variety of myths concerning the field. Many of these myths serve as deterrents for potential African American contributors. Some of these myths include the idea that computing sciences is only for nerds, only for White people, only for geniuses, or that to participate in computing, it is necessary to be isolated and buried in a cubicle. Therefore, the anomaly of participating in advanced-level computing demands a robust support network. Add the social isolation that comes with being an anomaly (African American) in an already analogous field and the necessity of the cohort model becomes more apparent.

The participation in a cohort is often the deciding factor for persistence in challenging domains such as computing sciences. Cohort building and participation are central elements of the computing career choice model.

B9

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 406

Thirty-seven computing sciences aspirants and practitioners were interviewed based on their individual time constraints and willingness to be participants in this study (55 percent female, 45 percent male). Interviews ranged from 30 to 45 minutes, one for each individual in the sample. Participants varied across educational levels: 22 percent were undergraduate students, 48 percent were graduate students, and 30 percent were PhD-minted professors or researchers. In addition, 50 percent of all participants either attended or were in the process of attending predominantly White institutions (PWIs), while 42 percent attended historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs) and 8 percent attended predominantly Black institutions. All participants resided in various regions of the United States ranging from the Southwest to the Northeast, and all were African American and had majored in or were majoring in a computing science-related field. The average participant age was 29 years. Participants had family socioeconomic status backgrounds across the spectrum of income categories. Most interviewees, however, were from middle-income, dual-parent households. In addition, the majority did not have a parent involved in computing sciences. The educational backgrounds of those participants with dual-parent households were similar insofar as they all attained similar levels of educational accomplishment, regardless of socioeconomic status.

Charleston 2012, 225

A total of 37 individual interviews were conducted for which the same protocol was applied. Interviews ranged from 30 to 45 min, one for each individual in the sample. From a percentage standpoint, 22% of interviewees were undergraduate students, 48% were graduate students, and 30% were PhD-minted professors or researchers. In addition, 50% of all participants either attended or were in the process of attending predominantly White institutions, 42% attended historically Black colleges and universities, and 8% attended predominantly Black institutions. All participants were African American and had majored in or were majoring in a computing science-related field, and the average participant age was 28.5 years (see Appendixes A–D).

Participants had family socioeconomic status backgrounds that ranged across the spectrum of categories. Most participants, however, were from middle-income, dual-parent households. In addition, the majority did not have a parent involved in computing sciences. The educational backgrounds of those participants with dual-parent households were similar insofar as they all attained similar levels of educational accomplishment, regardless of socioeconomic status.

B10

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson 2014, 408

Study participants cited a number of experiences throughout their educational trajectories in which aspects of culturally relevant interactions were instrumental in their decisions to pursue the computing sciences. While other research regarding persistence in STEM has illuminated negative social influences that deter underrepresented populations from persisting (e.g., Moore, 2006), the participants within this study expressed mostly positive social interactions that aided them throughout their trajectories. The participants under study were those who had gained measurable success in computing, which may be reflective of the positive iterations regarding their social experiences relating to computing. This is not to say that there were not sociocultural barriers experienced by the participants; however, these participants overcame these negative experiences—namely, with positive ones.

Although some participants cited their own interest and curiosity as a contributor to their information-seeking and knowledge-attainment surrounding computing careers, most of the participants credited their parents, professors, advisors, teachers, and friends who either majored in computing sciences, or encouraged and supported them throughout their trajectory as their primary reason for obtaining educational and occupational success. The thematic representations of these sentiments emerged in the form of culturally situated experiences that formed three major sub- themes: (a) peer and community modeling; (b) positive familial cultivation; and (c) multi-faceted mentorship.

Charleston 2012, 228

Participants cited a number of positive social interactions as being instrumental in their decisions to pursue computing science degrees. Whereas other research pertaining to STEM disciplines has illuminated negative social influences that deter underrepresented populations from persisting (ACT, 2006; Gilbert, Jackson, George, Charleston, & Daniels, 2007; Moore, 2006), the participants in this study largely described social interactions that aided them in their educational and computing development. Although interviewees had often gained measurable success in computing, this is not to say that barriers related to social aspects of their experiences did not exist. These iterations, however, generally came in the form of retrospective considerations about computing, as well aspects about it that they liked least.

Although some participants cited their own curiosity as a contributing factor toward an increased and more focused pursuit of computing, many credited their parents, professors, advisors, teachers, and friends as significant influences. These individuals majored in computing sciences, or encouraged, supported, and in some cases sponsored them to do so. These

sentiments emerged thematically in the form of positive social interactions and computing socialization, forming three major subthemes: (a) peer modeling or positive peer influence, (b) parental nurturing, and (c) mentorship.

B11

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson, 410

Parental and familial support and encouragement also played a significant role in culturally situated practices that influenced decision-making toward the computing sciences among participants—mainly up and through undergraduate entry and matriculation. This positive familial cultivation was often developed through moral, educational, and financial support for study participants. It generally began through early computer purchases, as well as the cultivation of computer adeptness through subsequent support by means of hardware and software purchases, encouraging or sponsoring supplementary education toward computing, or individualized efforts toward computer-related knowledge-gaining (e.g., having a friend teach their children programming).

Charleston 2012, 229

Parental nurturing also played a significant role with regard to positive social interaction, primarily through entry and settling into undergraduate education. These positive social interactions often presented themselves in the forms of moral, educational, and financial support. Such development was found to generally begin through computer purchases, progressing into the cultivation of computer savvy through hardware and software purchases. Parental encouragement or sponsorship of supplementary education toward computing or individualized efforts toward computer-related knowledge acquisition—the teaching of programming, for example—also proved to be common.

B12

Charleston, Charleston, and Jackson, 412

The results of this study suggest that the factors leading to the pursuit and persistence of the STEM field of computing sciences are largely attributed to culturally responsive practices whereby social construction trumps academic outlook among African Americans. Many participants demonstrated levels of aptitude, ambition, and self-initiative; however, these findings were not salient factors contributing to their pursuit and persistence in STEM. What

proved more salient were the positive social influences, community building, and sense of belonging, which developed self-efficacy and relevant self-concepts. These factors were often the catalyst for not only the introduction to computing sciences among the participants, but also the underlying rationale for successful matriculation and persistence in their STEM area through degree completion.

Charleston 2012, 231-32

Major findings in this study suggest that the decision to pursue computing sciences degrees among African Americans was dependent on factors that were mainly socially constructed. Although some participants did demonstrate high levels of ambition and self-initiative, these were not salient contributing factors to their actual degree attainment. What proved more salient were the positive social influences that often were the catalyst for not only the introduction to computing sciences among the participants but also the underlying rationale for persistence in the field through degree attainment.