

June 2, 2015

## **Letter Opposing the 2014 APUSH Framework**

The teaching of American history in our schools faces a grave new risk, from an unexpected source. Half a million students each year take the Advanced Placement (AP) exam in U.S. History. The framework for that exam has been dramatically changed, in ways certain to have negative consequences.

We wish to express our opposition to these modifications. The College Board's 2014 Advanced Placement Examination shortchanges students by imposing on them an arid, fragmentary, and misleading account of American history. We favor instead a robust, vivid, and content-rich account of our unfolding national drama, warts and all, a history that is alert to all the ways we have disagreed and fallen short of our ideals, while emphasizing the ways that we remain one nation with common ideals and a shared story.

The Advanced Placement exam has become a fixture in American education since its introduction after the Second World War, and many colleges and universities award credits based on students' AP scores. In fact, for many American students the AP test effectively has taken the place of the formerly required U.S. history survey course in colleges and universities, making its structure and contents a matter of even greater importance from the standpoint of civic education. Many of these students will never take another American history course. So it matters greatly what they learn in their last formal encounter with the subject.

Educators and the public have been willing to trust the College Board to strike a sensible balance among different approaches to the American past. Rather than issuing detailed guidelines, the College Board has in the past furnished a brief topical outline for teachers, leaving them free to choose what to emphasize. In addition, the previous AP U.S. History course featured a strong insistence on content, i.e., on the students' acquisition of extensive factual knowledge of American history.

But with the new 2014 framework, the College Board has put forward a lengthy 134-page document which repudiates that earlier approach, centralizes control,

deemphasizes content, and promotes a particular interpretation of American history. This interpretation downplays American citizenship and American world leadership in favor of a more global and transnational perspective. The College Board has long enjoyed an effective monopoly on advanced placement testing. The changes made in the new framework expose the danger in such a monopoly. The result smacks of an “official” account of the American past. Local, state, and federal policymakers may need to explore competitive alternatives to the College Board’s current domination of advanced-placement testing.

The new framework is organized around such abstractions as “identity,” “peopling,” “work, exchange, and technology,” and “human geography” while downplaying essential subjects, such as the sources, meaning, and development of America’s ideals and political institutions, notably the Constitution. Elections, wars, diplomacy, inventions, discoveries—all these formerly central subjects tend to dissolve into the vagaries of identity-group conflict. The new framework scrubs away all traces of what used to be the chief glory of historical writing—vivid and compelling narrative—and reduces history to an bloodless interplay of abstract and impersonal forces. Gone is the idea that history should provide a fund of compelling stories about exemplary people and events. No longer will students hear about America as a dynamic and exemplary nation, flawed in many respects, but whose citizens have striven through the years toward the more perfect realization of its professed ideals. The new version of the test will effectively marginalize important ways of teaching about the American past, and force American high schools to teach U.S. history from a perspective that self-consciously seeks to de-center American history and subordinate it to a global and heavily social-scientific perspective.

There are notable political or ideological biases inherent in the 2014 framework, and certain structural innovations that will inevitably result in imbalance in the test, and bias in the course. Chief among these is the treatment of American national identity. The 2010 framework treated national identity, including “views of the American national character and ideas about American exceptionalism” as a central theme. But the 2014 framework makes a dramatic shift away from that emphasis, choosing instead to grant far more extensive attention to “how various identities, cultures, and values have been preserved or changed in different contexts of U.S. history with special attention given to the formation of gender, class, racial and ethnic identities.” The new framework makes a shift from “identity” to “identities.” Indeed, the new framework is so populated with examples of American history as the conflict between social groups, and so inattentive to the sources of national unity and cohesion, that it is hard to see how

students will gain any coherent idea of what those sources might be. This does them, and us, an immense disservice.

We believe that the study of history should expose our young students to vigorous debates about the nature of American exceptionalism, American identity, and America's role in the world. Such debates are the warp and woof of historical understanding. We do not seek to reduce the education of our young to the inculcation of fairy tales, or of a simple, whitewashed, heroic, even hagiographical nationalist narrative. Instead, we support a course that fosters informed and reflective civic awareness, while providing a vivid sense of the grandeur and drama of its subject.

A formal education in American history serves young people best by equipping them for a life of deep and consequential membership in their own society. The College Board's 2014 framework sadly neglects this essential civic purpose of education in history. We can, and must, do better.

- *Scholars Concerned About Advanced Placement History*

### **Signatories**

*\*\*Affiliation for identification purposes only*

**John Agresto**, former President, St. John's College-Santa Fe, and former Deputy Chairman, National Endowment for the Humanities

**Patrick N. Allitt**, Cahoon Family Professor of American History, Emory University

**Stephen H. Balch**, Director of The Institute for the Study of Western Civilization, Texas Tech University, and Founder, National Association of Scholars

**Herman J. Belz**, Professor Emeritus of History, University of Maryland

**Gerard V. Bradley**, Professor of Law, University of Notre Dame

**James W. Ceaser**, Harry F. Byrd Professor of Politics, University of Virginia

**James Jay Carafano**, Military Historian, and Vice President, Foreign and Defense Policy Studies, E. W. Richardson Fellow, and Director of the Kathryn and Shelby Cullom Davis Institute for International Studies, Heritage Foundation

**John “Chuck” Chalberg**, Professor of History, Normandale College

**Lynne Cheney**, Former Chair, National Endowment for the Humanities

**Bruce Cole**, Distinguished Professor Emeritus of Art History, Indiana University, former Chairman of National Endowment for the Humanities, and Senior Fellow, Ethics and Public Policy Center

**Patrick J. Deneen**, David A. Potenziani Memorial Associate Professor of Constitutional Studies and Associate Professor of Political Science, University of Notre Dame

**Robert Faulkner**, Research Professor of Political Science, Boston College

**John Fonte**, Senior Fellow and Director of the Center for American Common Culture, Hudson Institute

**Richard Fonte**, Former Director, We the People Project, National Endowment for the Humanities, Former President, Austin Community College

**Robert George**, McCormick Professor of Jurisprudence and Director of the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions, Princeton University, and Herbert W. Vaughan Senior Fellow, Witherspoon Institute

**Charles Glenn**, Professor of Educational Leadership and Policy Studies, Boston University, and Co-Chair, International Conference on School Choice and Reform 2015

**Susan Hanssen**, Associate Professor of History, University of Dallas

**Victor Davis Hanson**, Martin and Illie Anderson Senior Fellow, Classics and Military History, The Hoover Institution, Stanford University

**John Earl Haynes**, 20th Century Political Historian, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress

**Michael Holt**, Langbourne M. Williams Professor Emeritus of American History, University of Virginia

**Philip Jenkins**, Distinguished Professor of History, Baylor University

**Robert Davis Johnson**, Professor of History, Brooklyn College, The City University of New York

**Amy A. Kass**, Sr. Lecturer Emerita, University of Chicago

**Leon R. Kass**, Addie Clark Harding Professor Emeritus, Committee on Social Thought, The University of Chicago, and Madden-Jewett Scholar, American Enterprise Institute

**Charles Kesler**, Dengler-Dykema Distinguished Professor of Government, Claremont McKenna College

**Ralph Ketcham**, Professor Emeritus of History, Public Affairs, and Political Science, Syracuse University, and Senior Research Associate, Campbell Public Affairs Institute

**Joseph Kett**, James Madison Professor Emeritus of History, University of Virginia

**Harvey Klehr**, Andrew W. Mellon Professor of Politics and History, Emory University

**Yuval Levin**, Editor, *National Affairs*, and Hertog Fellow, Ethics and Public Policy Center

**Gordon Lloyd**, Robert and Katheryn Dockson Professor of Public Policy, Pepperdine University

**Herb London**, Professor Emeritus and former John M. Olin Professor of Humanities, New York University, and former President, Hudson Institute

**Myron Magnet**, Manhattan Institute, and Author of *The Founders at Home: The Building of America, 1735-1817*

**Joyce Malcolm**, Patrick Henry Professor of Constitutional Law and the Second Amendment, George Mason University School of Law

**Harvey Mansfield**, William R. Kenan, Jr. Professor of Government, Harvard University

**Peter Mansoor**, Raymond E. Mason Jr. Chair in Military History, Ohio State University

**George Marsden**, Professor Emeritus of History, University of Notre Dame

**Ted McAllister**, Edward L. Gaylord Chair, and Associate Professor of Public Policy, Pepperdine University

**Wilfred McClay**, G.T. and Libby Blankenship Chair in the History of Liberty, and Director of the Center for the History of Liberty, University of Oklahoma

**Robert Merry**, Historian, former Publishing Executive

**Wilson D. Miscamble**, Professor of History, University of Notre Dame

**Joshua Mitchell**, Professor of Government, Georgetown University

**Paul D. Moreno**, William and Berniece Grewcock Chair in Constitutional History, Hillsdale College

**Mark Moyar**, Senior Fellow, Joint Special Operations University, and Author of *Triumph Forsaken*

**Johnathan O'Neill**, Chair, Department of History, Georgia Southern University

**Robert Paquette**, Professor of History, Hamilton College

**Ronald Radosh**, Professor Emeritus of 20th Century US History, The City University of New York, and Hudson Institute

**Paul Rahe**, Charles O. Lee and Louise K. Lee Chair in the Western Heritage,  
and Professor of History, Hillsdale College

**Thomas Reeves**, Professor Emeritus of History, University of Wisconsin-  
Parkside

**Daniel Robinson**, Fellow, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford

**Diana Schaub**, Professor of Political Science, Loyola University Maryland

**Mark Smith**, Carolina Distinguished Professor of History, University of South  
Carolina

**James Stoner**, Professor of Political Science, Louisiana State University

**Sandra Stotsky**, Professor Emerita of Education Reform, University of  
Arkansas

**Stephan Thernstrom**, Winthrop Professor Emeritus of History, Harvard  
University, and Senior Fellow, Manhattan Institute

**Jean M. Yarbrough**, Gary M. Penty Sr. Professor of Social Sciences,  
Bowdoin College

**Donald Yerxa**, former Director, The Historical Society, and Editor,  
*Historically Speaking*

## **Additional Signatories as of June 25, 2015**

*\*\*Affiliation for identification purposes only*

**Michael Allen**, Professor of History, School of Interdisciplinary Arts and Sciences, University of Washington, Tacoma

**Elizabeth Altham**, Instructor in AP U.S. History, Our Lady of the Sacred Heart Academy, Rockford, Illinois

**Douglas Ambrose**, Professor of History, Hamilton College

**Marc S. Anderson**, AP U.S. History instructor and social studies department chair, Northern High School, Dillsburg, Pennsylvania

**Michael Auslin**, Resident Scholar and Director of Japan Studies, American Enterprise Institute for Public Policy Research

**Ronald H. Averill**, Former Dean of Social Sciences, South Puget Sound Community College

**Michael Barton**, Professor of American Studies and Social Science, Pennsylvania State University at Harrisburg

**Fred Baumann**, Professor of Political Science, Kenyon College

**Christopher Beneke**, Associate Professor of History, Bentley University

**Robert Nicholas Berard**, Professor of History and Education, Mount Saint Vincent University

**Jay Bergman**, Professor of History, Central Connecticut State University

**Suzanne Geissler Bowles**, Professor of History and American Studies Minor Coordinator, William Paterson University

**Robert Bresler**, Professor Emeritus of Public Policy, Pennsylvania State University, Harrisburg



**Kent Masterson Brown**, President, Witnessing History, LLC

**Richard Buitron**, Adjunct Professor, San Antonio College

**Jonathan Burack**, President, Burack Educational Services

**Colin B. Burke**, Independent Scholar, and Associate Professor Emeritus of History, University of Maryland-Baltimore County

**Michael Burlingame**, Chancellor Naomi B. Lynn Distinguished Chair in Lincoln Studies, History Department, University of Illinois at Springfield

**Peter Cohee**, Teacher, Weston High School, Weston, MA

**Ashley Cruseturner**, Professor of History, McLennan Community College

**Paul du Quenoy**, Associate Professor of History, American University of Beirut

**William C. Dennis**, Former Professor of American History, Denison University, and former President, Philadelphia Society

**Nicholas Doom**, Instructor in AP U.S. History and Social Studies, Anderson W. Clark Magnet High School, La Crescenta, California

**John C. Eastman**, Henry Salvatori Professor of Law and Community Service and Former Dean, Dale E. Fowler School of Law at Chapman University

**John T. Fishel**, Lecturer, International and Area Studies, College of International Studies, The University of Oklahoma, and Emeritus Professor, National Defense University

**Matthew Franck**, Director, William E. and Carol G. Simon Center on Religion and the Constitution, Witherspoon Institute, Professor Emeritus of Political Science, Radford University

**Burton W. Folsom, Jr.**, Charles F. Kline Chair in History and Management, Hillsdale College

**Charles Gesheker**, Professor of History, Emeritus, California State University, Chico

**Kevin Gutzman**, Professor and Chair-elect of History, Western Connecticut State University

**Doreen Hamilton**, Former College English Instructor, University of Washington, and Former Teacher, Seattle Public Schools

**Don Hickey**, Professor of History, Wayne State College

**Kevin Jenkins**, Associate Professor, Tift College of Education, Mercer University

**Donald Kagan**, Dean Emeritus, Yale College, and Sterling Professor of Classics and History, Yale University

**Kevin Kijewski**, Superintendent of Schools, Archdiocese of Denver, and Adjunct Professor of Education, University of Southern California Rossier School of Education

**Anthony K. Knopp**, Emeritus Professor of History, University of Texas at Brownsville

**Robert C. Koons**, Professor of Philosophy, University of Texas at Austin

**Kirby Lehman**, Former Superintendent, Jenks Public Schools

**Mary Anne Marcella**, 5th Grade History Teacher, New York City

**James W. Muller**, Professor and Chair of Political Science, University of Alaska, Anchorage

**Larry D. Nachman**, Emeritus Professor of Political Science, College of Staten Island, City University of New York

**D. Brendan Nagle**, Professor Emeritus of History, University of Southern California

**William Nancarrow**, Interim Dean of Faculty, Associate Professor of History, Curry College

**Patrick Nolan**, Professor Emeritus of Sociology, University of South Carolina

**Ronald Pestritto**, Graduate Dean and Professor of Politics and Charles and Lucia Shipley Chair in the American Constitution, Hillsdale College

**Roger Ream**, President, Fund for American Studies

**Glenn Ricketts**, Professor of Political Science, Raritan Valley Community College, Public Affairs Director, National Association of Scholars

**Kevin Roberts**, President, Wyoming Catholic College

**William Saxby**, Dean and Professor of Psychology, Colorado Christian University, School of Humanities and Science

**David Schaefer**, Professor of Political Science, College of the Holy Cross

**Kurt Schuler**, Senior Fellow in Financial History, Center for Financial Stability

**Maimon Schwarzschild**, Professor of Law, University of San Diego

**Larry Schwiekart**, Professor of History, University of Dayton

**Gilbert T. Sewall**, Director, American Textbook Council

**Colleen Sheehan**, Professor of Political Science, Villanova University, Director, Ryan Center for the Study of Free Institutions, member, Pennsylvania State Board of Education

**Joseph Morrison Skelly**, Professor of History and Chair of the Department of History, College of Mount Saint Vincent

**Meghan Slanina**, AP U.S. History and AP U.S. Government instructor, Holy Name High School, Parma Heights, Ohio

**Steven Smith**, Research Associate Professor in Archeology and Anthropology, South Carolina Institute of Archaeology, University of South Carolina

**Phoebe S. Spinrad**, Professor Emerita of English, Ohio State University

**Lawrence Squeri**, Professor Emeritus of History, East Stroudsburg University

**Stanley W. Trimble**, Professor Emeritus of Geography, University of California, Los Angeles

**Michael Uhlmann**, Research Professor of American Politics, Claremont Graduate University

**Jack Warren**, Executive Director, American Revolution Institute of the Society of the Cincinnati

**Bradley C.S. Watson**, Professor of Politics, Center for Political and Economic Thought, Saint Vincent College

**Robert Whealey**, Professor Emeritus of History, Ohio University

**David M. Whalen**, Provost and Professor of English, Hillsdale College

**Steven E. Woodworth**, Professor of History, Texas Christian University

*If you would like to be considered as an additional signatory, please see instructions at [www.nas.org/articles/open\\_letter\\_american\\_historians](http://www.nas.org/articles/open_letter_american_historians).*